## Turbulence and CFD models: Theory and applications

## Part 1

- 1. The closure problem
- 2. Exact equations and solvable equations
- 3. Derivation of the Reynolds stress transport equation
- 4. Derivation of the turbulent kinetic energy equation
- 5. Another touch to the closure problem

# Part 1

### 1. The closure problem

- 2. Exact equations and solvable equations
- 3. Derivation of the Reynolds stress transport equation
- 4. Derivation of the turbulent kinetic energy equation
- 5. Another touch to the closure problem

• Let us recall the incompressible RANS equations,

$$\nabla \cdot (\bar{\mathbf{u}}) = 0$$

$$\frac{\partial \bar{\mathbf{u}}}{\partial t} + \nabla \cdot (\bar{\mathbf{u}}\bar{\mathbf{u}}) = -\frac{1}{\rho} (\nabla p) + \nu \nabla^2 \bar{\mathbf{u}} + \frac{1}{\rho} \nabla \cdot \boldsymbol{\tau}^R$$

- At this point, the problem reduces on how to compute the Reynolds stress tensor.
- In CFD we do not want to resolve the velocity fluctuations as it requires very fine meshes and small time-steps.
- That is, we do not want to solve the small scales due to the fluctuating velocities and transported quantiles.
- The RANS/URANS approach to turbulence modeling requires the Reynolds stress tensor to be appropriately modeled in terms of known quantities (mean flow).

- Different approaches can be used to model the Reynolds stress tensor  $oldsymbol{ au}^R$ .
  - Algebraic models.
  - Boussinesq approximation.
  - Non-linear eddy viscosity models.
  - Reynolds stress transport models.
  - Algebraic stress models.
- Have in mind that the literature is very rich when it comes to turbulence models.
- We will explore the most commonly used approaches.

• Overview of the main turbulence modeling approaches.



- At the same time, RANS/URANS models can be classified according to the number of equations.
  - First-order closure models:
    - 0-equation, <sup>1</sup>/<sub>2</sub>-equation, 1-equation, 2-equation, 3-equation, and so on.
  - Second-order closure models (also called second-moment closure SMC, Reynolds stress modeling RSM, or Reynolds stress transport RST):
    - Reynolds-stress transport models RSM (7-equations).
    - Algebraic Reynolds-stress models ARSM (2-equations).
  - These formulations can use linear or non-linear eddy viscosity models.
  - Just to name a few models:
    - Baldwin-Barth, Spalart-Allmaras,  $k-\epsilon$ ,  $k-\omega$  SST,  $k-kl-\omega$ , LRR, SSG, Langtry-Menter SST, V2-F, Launder-Sharma,  $q-\zeta$ .
  - We only listed a small fraction of turbulence models. As you will find, there is a plethora of turbulence models.
  - Our goal, use the less wrong model in a very critical way.

- Turbulence models equations cannot be derived from fundamental principles.
- All turbulence models contain some sort of empiricism.
- Some level of calibration to observed physical solutions, numerical solutions, or analytical solutions is contained in every turbulence models.
- Also, some intelligent guessing is used.
- A lot of uncertainty is involved!

"Remember that all models are wrong; the practical question is how wrong do they have to be to not be useful."

G. E. P. Box

"Models are as good as the assumptions you put into them."

# Part 1

### **1. The closure problem**

- 2. Exact equations and solvable equations
- 3. Derivation of the Reynolds stress transport equation
- 4. Derivation of the turbulent kinetic energy equation
- 5. Another touch to the closure problem

#### **Exact equations and solvable equations**

- In our discussion, when we talk about exact equations, we refer to the governing equations that were derived without using approximations.
- Whereas, when we talk about the solvable equations, we refer to the governing equations derived from the exact equations using approximations.
- The **solvable** equations are those that we are going to solve using different approximations, *e.g.*, Boussinesq hypothesis.
- In few words, in the **solvable** equations we are inserting approximations to avoid solving the small scales.

#### **Exact equations and solvable equations**

For example, the exact RANS equations, can be written as follows,

$$\begin{aligned} \nabla \cdot \left( \bar{\mathbf{u}} \right) &= 0 \\ \frac{\partial \bar{\mathbf{u}}}{\partial t} + \nabla \cdot \left( \bar{\mathbf{u}} \bar{\mathbf{u}} \right) &= -\frac{1}{\rho} \left( \nabla p \right) + \nu \nabla^2 \bar{\mathbf{u}} + \frac{1}{\rho} \nabla \cdot \boldsymbol{\tau}^R \qquad \text{where} \qquad \boldsymbol{\tau}^R = -\rho \left( \overline{\mathbf{u}' \mathbf{u}'} \right) \end{aligned}$$

 Then, the solvable RANS equations (after using approximations), can be written as follows,

$$\nabla \cdot (\bar{\mathbf{u}}) = 0$$
  
$$\frac{\partial \bar{\mathbf{u}}}{\partial t} + \nabla \cdot (\bar{\mathbf{u}}\bar{\mathbf{u}}) = -\frac{1}{\rho} \left( \nabla \bar{p} + \frac{2}{3}\rho \nabla k \right) + \nabla \cdot \left[ \frac{1}{\rho} \left( \mu + \mu_t \right) \nabla \bar{\mathbf{u}} \right]$$

- In this case, the solvable RANS equations were obtained after substituting the Boussinesq approximation into the exact RANS equations.
- The problem now reduces to computing the turbulent eddy viscosity in the momentum equation.

## Part 1

- **1. The closure problem**
- 2. Exact equations and solvable equations
- 3. Derivation of the Reynolds stress transport equation
- 4. Derivation of the turbulent kinetic energy equation
- 5. Another touch to the closure problem

- To derive the Reynolds stress transport equation, we can proceed as follows,
  - Starting from the Navier-Stokes equations with no models (often known as the laminar NSE equations), we apply a first order moment to the equations.
  - That is, we multiply the NSE by the fluctuating velocities  $u'_i$  and  $u'_j$ , so we obtain a second order tensor.
  - Then, the instantaneous velocity and pressure are replaced with the respective Reynolds decomposition expression.
  - At this point, we time average the equations.
  - Finally, we do a lot of algebra to simplify the resulting equations.
  - We also use the same averaging rules and vector identities used when deriving the RANS equations.
  - Plus some additional differentiation rules.

- To derive the Reynolds stress transport equation, we can proceed as follows,
  - Starting from the Navier-Stokes equations with no models (often known as the laminar NSE equations), we apply a first order moment to the equations.
  - That is, we multiply the NSE by the fluctuating velocities  $u'_i$  and  $u'_i$ .
  - Then, the instantaneous velocity and pressure are replaced with the respective Reynolds decomposition expression.
  - At this point, we time average the equations.
  - Finally, we do a lot of algebra to simplify the resulting equations.

$$\underbrace{\frac{\partial \tau_{ij}^R}{\partial t}}_{1} + \underbrace{\bar{u}_k \frac{\partial \tau_{ij}^R}{x_k}}_{2} = \underbrace{-\left(\tau_{ik}^R \frac{\partial \bar{u}_j}{\partial x_k} + \tau_{jk}^R \frac{\partial \bar{u}_i}{\partial x_k}\right)}_{3} + \underbrace{2\nu \frac{\partial u_i'}{\partial x_k} \frac{\partial u_j'}{\partial x_k}}_{4} + \dots$$

$$\dots + \underbrace{\frac{1}{\rho} \left( \overline{u'_i \frac{\partial p'}{\partial x_j}} + \overline{u'_j \frac{\partial p'}{\partial x_i}} \right)}_{5} + \underbrace{\frac{\partial}{\partial x_k} \left( \nu \frac{\partial \tau^R_{ij}}{\partial x_k} \right)}_{6} + \underbrace{\frac{\partial}{\partial x_k} \left( \overline{u'_i u'_j u'_k} \right)}_{7}$$

- 1. Transient stress rate of change term.
- 2. Convective term.
- 3. Production term.
- 4. Dissipation rate.
- 5. Turbulent stress transport related to the velocity and pressure fluctuations.
- 6. Rate of viscous stress diffusion (molecular).
- 7. Diffusive stress transport resulting from the triple correlation of velocity fluctuations.

- Let us derive the Reynolds stress transport equation.
- Let  $\mathcal{N}(u_i)$  denote the Naiver-Stokes operator,

$$\mathcal{N}(u_i) = \rho \frac{\partial u_i}{\partial t} + \rho u_k \frac{\partial u_i}{\partial x_k} + \frac{\partial p}{\partial x_i} - \mu \frac{\partial^2 u_i}{\partial x_k x_k} = 0$$

 To derive the Reynolds stress transport equation, we form the following time average,

$$\overline{u_i'\mathcal{N}(u_j) + u_j'\mathcal{N}(u_i)} = 0$$

- Then, the instantaneous velocity and pressure variables are replaced with the respective Reynolds decomposition.
- Finally, we do a lot of algebra in order to simplify the equations.
- Let us work in a term by term basis.

• Unsteady term,

$$\begin{split} \overline{u_i'(\rho u_j)_{,t} + u_j'(\rho u_i)_{,t}} &= \rho \overline{u_i'(\bar{u}_j + u_j')_{,t}} + \rho \overline{u_j'(\bar{u}_i + u_i')_{,t}} \\ &= \rho \overline{u_i'\bar{u}_{j,t}} + \rho \overline{u_i'u_{j,t}'} + \rho \overline{u_j'\bar{u}_{i,t}} + \rho \overline{u_j'u_{i,t}'} \\ &= \rho \overline{u_i'u_{j,t}'} + \rho \overline{u_j'u_{i,t}'} \\ &= \rho \overline{(u_i'u_j')_{,t}} \\ &= -\rho \frac{\partial \tau_{ij}}{\partial t} \end{split}$$

• Convective term,

$$\overline{\rho u_i' u_k u_{j,k} + \rho u_j' u_k u_{i,k}} = \rho \overline{u_i'(\bar{u}_k + u_k')(\bar{u}_j + u_j')_{,k}} + \rho \overline{u_j'(\bar{u}_k + u_k')(\bar{u}_i + u_i')_{,k}}$$

$$= \rho \overline{u_i' \bar{u}_k u_{j,k}'} + \rho \overline{u_i' u_k'(\bar{u}_j + u_i')_{,k}} + \rho \overline{u_j' \bar{u}_k u_{i,k}'} + \rho \overline{u_j' u_k'(\bar{u}_i + u_i')_{,k}}$$

$$= \rho \bar{u}_k \overline{(u_i' u_j')_{,k}} + \rho \overline{u_i' u_k'} \bar{u}_{j,k} + \rho \overline{u_j' u_k'} \bar{u}_{i,k} + \rho \overline{u_k(u_i' u_j')_{,k}}$$

$$= -\rho \bar{u}_k \frac{\partial \tau_{ij}}{\partial x_k} - \rho \tau_{ik} \frac{\partial \bar{u}_j}{\partial x_k} - \rho \tau_{jk} \frac{\partial \bar{u}_i}{\partial x_k} + \rho \frac{\partial}{\partial x_k} \overline{(u_i' u_j' u_k')}$$

• Pressure gradient term,

$$\overline{u'_i p_{,j} + u'_j p_{,i}} = \overline{u'_i (\bar{p} + p')_{,j}} + \overline{u'_j (\bar{p} + p')_{,i}}$$
$$= \overline{u'_i p'_{,j} + u'_j p'_{,i}}$$
$$= \overline{u'_i \frac{\partial p'}{\partial x_j}} + \overline{u'_j \frac{\partial p'}{\partial x_i}}$$

• Viscous term,

$$\begin{split} \mu\overline{(u_i'u_{j,kk} + u_j'u_{i,kk})} &= \mu\overline{u_i'(\bar{u}_j + u_j')_{,kk}} + \mu\overline{u_j'(\bar{u}_i + u_i')_{,kk}} \\ &= \mu\overline{u_i'u_{j,kk}'} + \mu\overline{u_j'u_{i,kk}'} \\ &= \mu\overline{(u_i'u_{j,k}')_{,k}} + \mu\overline{(u_j'u_{i,k}')_{,k}} - 2\mu\overline{u_{i,k}'u_{j,k}'} \\ &= \mu\overline{(u_i'u_j')_{,kk}} - 2\mu\overline{u_{i,k}'u_{j,k}'} \\ &= -\mu\frac{\partial^2\tau_{ij}}{\partial x_k\partial x_k} - 2\mu\overline{\frac{\partial u_i'}{\partial x_k}}\frac{\partial u_j'}{\partial x_k} \end{split}$$

• Collecting terms, we arrive at the transport equation for the Reynolds stress tensor,

$$\frac{\partial \tau_{ij}}{\partial t} + \bar{u}_k \frac{\partial \tau_{ij}}{\partial x_k} = -\tau_{ik} \frac{\partial \bar{u}_j}{\partial x_k} - \tau_{jk} \frac{\partial \bar{u}_i}{\partial x_k} + \frac{\partial \bar{u}_i}{\partial x_k} + \frac{\partial \bar{u}_j}{\partial x_k} + \frac{\partial \bar{u}_i}{\partial x_j} + \frac{\partial \bar{u}_j}{\partial x_j} + \frac{\partial \bar{u}_j}{\partial x_i} + \frac{\partial \bar{u}_j}{\partial x_i} + \frac{\partial \bar{u}_j}{\partial x_k} \left[ \nu \frac{\partial \tau_{ij}}{\partial x_k} + \overline{u}_i' \frac{u_j' u_j' u_k'}{u_j' u_k'} \right]$$

• These equations can be further simplified as follows,

$$\frac{\partial \tau_{ij}}{\partial t} + \bar{u}_k \frac{\partial \tau_{ij}}{\partial x_k} = -\tau_{ik} \frac{\partial \bar{u}_j}{\partial x_k} - \tau_{jk} \frac{\partial \bar{u}_i}{\partial x_k} + \epsilon_{ij} - \Pi_{ij} + \frac{\partial}{\partial x_k} \left[ \nu \frac{\partial \tau_{ij}}{\partial x_k} + C_{ijk} \right]$$

• Where,

$$\epsilon_{ij} = 2\nu \overline{\frac{\partial u_i'}{\partial x_k} \frac{\partial u_j'}{\partial x_k}} \qquad \qquad \Pi_{ij} = \overline{\frac{p'}{\rho} \left(\frac{\partial u_i'}{\partial x_j} + \frac{\partial u_j'}{\partial x_i}\right)}$$

$$\rho C_{ijk} = \rho \overline{u'_i u'_j u'_k} + \overline{p' u'_i} \delta_{jk} + \overline{p' u'_j} \delta_{ik}$$

- These are the **exact** Reynolds stress transport equations.
- To derive the **solvable** equations, we need to use approximations in place of the terms that contain velocity fluctuations ( $\epsilon_{ij}$ ,  $\Pi_{ij}$ ,  $\rho C_{ijk}$ ).
- The Reynolds stresses can be modeled using the Boussinesq approximation.

## Part 1

- **1. The closure problem**
- 2. Exact equations and solvable equations
- 3. Derivation of the Reynolds stress transport equation
- 4. Derivation of the turbulent kinetic energy equation
- 5. Another touch to the closure problem

#### Derivation of the turbulent kinetic energy equation

- The transport equation for the turbulent kinetic energy can be derived by just taking the trace of the Reynolds stress transport equation.
- Let us recall that,

$$k = \frac{1}{2}\overline{u_i'u_i'} = \frac{1}{2}\left(\overline{u'^2} + \overline{v'^2} + \overline{w'^2}\right)$$

$$-(\overline{\mathbf{u'u'}})^{\mathrm{tr}} = -(\overline{u'_i u'_i}) = \tau_{ii} = -2k$$

By taking the trace (i = j) of the Reynolds stress equation we obtain,

$$\underbrace{\frac{\partial \tau_{ii}}{\partial t}}_{1} + \underbrace{\bar{u}_k \frac{\partial \tau_{ii}}{\partial x_k}}_{2} = \underbrace{2\tau_{ij} \frac{\partial \bar{u}_i}{\partial x_j}}_{3} + \underbrace{\epsilon_{ii}}_{4} + \underbrace{\frac{\partial}{\partial x_k} \left(\nu \frac{\partial \tau_{ii}}{\partial x_k}\right)}_{5} + \underbrace{\frac{2}{\rho} \left(\overline{u'_i \frac{\partial p'}{\partial x_i}}\right)}_{6} + \underbrace{\frac{\partial}{\partial x_k} (\overline{u'_i u'_i u'_k})}_{7}$$

- 1. Transient rate of change term.
- 2. Convective term.
- 3. Production term arising from the product of the Reynolds stress and the velocity gradient.
- 4. Dissipation rate.

- Rate of viscous stress diffusion (molecular).
- 6. Turbulent transport associated with the eddy pressure and velocity fluctuations.
- 7. Diffusive turbulent transport resulting from the triple correlation of velocity fluctuations.

#### Derivation of the turbulent kinetic energy equation

• We can now substitute  $\tau_{ii} = -2k$  and simplify to obtain the following equation,

$$\frac{\partial k}{\partial t} + \bar{u}_j \frac{\partial k}{\partial x_j} = \tau_{ij} \frac{\partial \bar{u}_i}{\partial x_j} - \epsilon + \frac{\partial}{\partial x_j} \left[ \nu \frac{\partial k}{\partial x_j} - \frac{1}{2} \overline{u'_i u'_i u'_j} - \frac{1}{\rho} \overline{p' u'_j} \right]$$

• Where  $\epsilon$  is the dissipation rate (per unit mass) as is given by the following relation,

$$\epsilon_{ii} = \epsilon = \nu \frac{\partial u_i'}{\partial x_j} \frac{\partial u_i'}{\partial x_j}$$

- This is the **exact** turbulent kinetic energy transport equation.
- To derive the **solvable** equation, we need to use approximations in place of the terms that contain velocity fluctuations.
- The Reynolds stresses can be modeled using the Boussinesq approximation.

## Part 1

- **1. The closure problem**
- 2. Exact equations and solvable equations
- 3. Derivation of the Reynolds stress transport equation
- 4. Derivation of the turbulent kinetic energy equation
- 5. Another touch to the closure problem

- We just derived the **exact** form of the Reynolds stress transport equation and the **exact** form of the transport equation for the turbulent kinetic energy.
- The **exact** form of the turbulent kinetic energy was derived from the Reynolds stress transport equation; therefore, they share some similarities.
- Namely, a production term (eddy factory), a dissipation or destruction term (where eddies are destroyed – eddy graveyard – ), and a turbulence diffusion term (transport, diffusion, and redistribution due to turbulence).



- It is easy to see that any other derived turbulent quantity  $\phi$  can be expressed in the same way,



From the solvable RANS equations, our problem reduces to computing the turbulent viscosity.

$$\nabla \cdot (\bar{\mathbf{u}}) = 0$$

$$\frac{\partial \bar{\mathbf{u}}}{\partial t} + \nabla \cdot (\bar{\mathbf{u}}\bar{\mathbf{u}}) = -\frac{1}{\rho} \left( \nabla \bar{p} + \frac{2}{3}\rho \nabla k \right) + \nabla \cdot \begin{bmatrix} \frac{1}{\rho} \left(\mu + \mu_t\right) \nabla \bar{\mathbf{u}} \end{bmatrix}$$

$$Turbulent \text{ viscosity}}$$

- As we have seen, a relationship for the turbulent viscosity can be derived by using dimensional analysis.
- We just need to find a combination of variables that results in the same units of the molecular viscosity,

$$\mu_t = f(k, \epsilon, \omega, l, t, v, \ldots)$$

• We should also be careful that we do not introduce more variables than equations.

- We just derived an equation for the turbulent kinetic energy.
- So using the turbulent kinetic energy, we can compute the turbulent kinematic viscosity as follows,

$$\nu_t = \frac{C_\mu k^2}{\epsilon} \qquad \qquad \nu_t = \frac{k}{\omega}$$

- Now we need to derive an additional turbulent transport equation to properly close the system (our closure problem).
- In this case, we need an equation for  $\epsilon$  or  $\omega$ .
- These are two equations models, which are probably the most widely used models.
- Remember, there are many models.
- Have in mind that at the end of the day all equations must be rewritten in terms of mean quantities.

• At the end of the day this is our problem (with closure using the  $k - \epsilon$  turbulence model),

$$\nabla \cdot (\bar{\mathbf{u}}) = 0$$
  
$$\frac{\partial \bar{\mathbf{u}}}{\partial t} + \nabla \cdot (\bar{\mathbf{u}}\bar{\mathbf{u}}) = -\frac{1}{\rho} \left( \nabla \bar{p} + \frac{2}{3}\rho \nabla k \right) + \nabla \cdot \left[ \frac{1}{\rho} \left( \mu + \mu_t \right) \nabla \bar{\mathbf{u}} \right]$$
  
$$\nabla_t k + \nabla \cdot \left( \bar{\mathbf{u}} k \right) = \tau^R : \nabla \bar{\mathbf{u}} - \epsilon + \nabla \cdot \left[ \left( \nu + \frac{\nu_t}{\sigma_k} \right) \nabla k \right]$$
  
$$\nabla_t \epsilon + \nabla \cdot \left( \bar{\mathbf{u}} \epsilon \right) = C_{\epsilon_1} \frac{\epsilon}{k} \tau^R : \nabla \bar{\mathbf{u}} - C_{\epsilon_2} \frac{\epsilon^2}{k} + \nabla \cdot \left[ \left( \nu + \frac{\nu_t}{\sigma_\epsilon} \right) \nabla \epsilon \right]$$

• With the following closure coefficients,

 $C_{\epsilon_1} = 1.44$   $C_{\epsilon_2} = 1.92$   $C_{\mu} = 0.09$   $\sigma_k = 1.0$   $\sigma_{\epsilon} = 1.3$ 

And closure relationships,

$$\nu_t = \frac{C_\mu k^2}{\epsilon} \qquad \qquad \omega = \frac{\epsilon}{C_\mu k} \qquad \qquad l = \frac{C_\mu k^{3/2}}{\epsilon}$$

 And as this is an IVBP problem, you need to assign boundary and initial conditions to all variables.

- Summarizing:
  - By using the Reynolds decomposition and time-averaging the governing Navier-Stokes equations, we obtain the RANS/URANS equations.
  - The Reynolds stress tensor  $oldsymbol{ au}^R$  appearing in the RANS/URANS equations needs to be modeled.
    - The most widely used approach is the Boussinesq approximation.
  - From the Boussinesq approximation a new variable emerges, namely, the turbulent viscosity  $\mu_t$ .
  - To compute the turbulent viscosity  $\mu_t$  we need to use additional closure equations.
    - We just illustrated the  $k \epsilon$  model, which solves two additional equations. One for the turbulent kinetic energy k and one for the turbulent dissipation rate  $\epsilon$ .
  - All equations used must be expressed in terms of mean flow quantities. That is, we need to remove the instantaneous fluctuations from the equations by using proper engineering approximations.
  - This is our closure problem.
  - Remember, the derivation of the equation for the turbulent viscosity is based on dimensional analysis.
  - Which does not tell much about the underlying physics of the relationships used, so we need to be very critical when using turbulence models.